

General Purpose Standing Committee No.2

Budget Estimates 2004-2005

Ordered to be printed 23 March 2005

New South Wales Parliamentary Library cataloguing-in-publication data:

New South Wales. Parliament. Legislative Council. General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2

Budget estimates, 2004-2005 : [report] / General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2. [Sydney, N.S.W.] : The Committee, 2005. – [17] p. 30 cm. (Report / General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2 ; no. 18, March 2005)

Chair: Gordon Moyes.

“Ordered to be printed 23 March 2005”

ISBN 0-7347-6482-0

1. Budget—New South Wales.
2. New South Wales—Appropriations and expenditures.
 - I. Title.
 - II. Moyes, Gordon.
- III. Series: New South Wales. Parliament. Legislative Council. General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2. Report ; no. 18.

DDC 352.49944

How to contact the committee

Members of the General Purpose Standing Committee No.2 can be contacted through the Committee Secretariat. Written correspondence and enquiries should be directed to:

The Director

General Purpose Standing Committee No.2

Legislative Council

Parliament House, Macquarie Street

Sydney New South Wales 2000

Internet www.parliament.nsw.gov.au

Email budgetestimates@parliament.nsw.gov.au

Telephone 9230 3544

Facsimile 9230 3416

Terms of Reference

1. That the Budget Estimates and related papers for the financial year 2004-2005 presenting the amounts to be appropriated from the Consolidated Fund be referred to the General Purpose Standing Committees for inquiry and report.
2. That the committees consider the Budget Estimates in accordance with the allocation of portfolios to the committees.
3. For the purposes of this inquiry any member of the House may attend a meeting of a committee in relation to the Budget Estimates and question witnesses, participate in the deliberations of the committee at such meeting and make a dissenting statement relating to the Budget Estimates, but may not vote or be counted for the purpose of any quorum.
4. The committees must hear evidence on the Budget Estimates in public.
5. Not more than 2 committees are to hear evidence on the Budget Estimates simultaneously.
6. When a committee hears evidence on the Budget Estimates, the Chair is to call on items of expenditure in the order decided on and declare the proposed expenditure open for examination.
7. The committees may ask for explanations from Ministers in the House, or officers of departments, statutory bodies or corporations, relating to the items of proposed expenditure.
8. The report of a committee on the Budget Estimates may propose the further consideration of any items.
9. That a daily Hansard record of the hearings of a committee on the Budget Estimates be published as soon as practicable after each day's proceedings.
10. That the Leader of the Government is to provide to each Committee, by 6 July 2004, a schedule outlining the attendance of relevant ministers to appear before each committee, for the committee's consideration.
11. The committees may hold supplementary hearings as required.
12. The committees present a final report to the House by the last sitting day of the second sitting week in 2005—put and passed.

(Minutes of proceedings No 61 pages 886-888, 23 June 2004)

Committee Membership

| | | |
|---|----------------------------|---------------------|
| Revd the Hon Dr Gordon Moyes MLC* | Christian Democratic Party | <i>Chair</i> |
| Hon Patricia Forsythe MLC** | Liberal Party | <i>Deputy Chair</i> |
| Hon Tony Catanzariti MLC*** | Australian Labor Party | |
| Hon Christine Robertson MLC | Australian Labor Party | |
| Hon Henry Tsang MLC | Australian Labor Party | |
| Hon Melinda Pavey MLC | The Nationals | |
| Hon Dr Arthur Chesterfield-Evans MLC | Australian Democrats | |

Other Members who attended the hearings

| | |
|--------------------------------|------------------------|
| Hon Amanda Fazio MLC | Australian Labor Party |
| Hon Eddie Obeid MLC | Australian Labor Party |
| Hon David Oldfield MLC | One Nation Party |
| Hon Robyn Parker MLC | The Nationals |
| Hon Eric Roozendaal MLC | Australian Labor Party |
| Hon John Ryan MLC | Liberal Party |
| Hon Ian West MLC | Australian Labor Party |

* The Hon Rev Dr Gordon Moyes MLC resigned as Chair of the Committee on Thursday 28 October 2004 (Minutes No 32).

** The Hon Patricia Forsythe MLC was elected Chair of the Committee on Thursday 28 October 2004, thus vacating the position of Deputy Chair. (Minutes No 32)

***The Hon Tony Cantanzariti MLC was elected Deputy Chair on Thursday 28 October 2004. (Minutes No 32)

Table of Contents

| | | |
|-------------------|---|----------|
| | How to contact the committee | iii |
| | Terms of Reference | iv |
| | Committee Membership | v |
| | Other Members who attended the hearings | v |
| | Chair's Foreword | vii |
| Chapter 1 | Introduction | 1 |
| | Examination of budget estimates | 1 |
| | Portfolios | 1 |
| Chapter 2 | Public hearings – by portfolio | 2 |
| | Health | 2 |
| | Gaming and Racing | 3 |
| | Tourism, Sport and Recreation, Women | 3 |
| | Tourism | 3 |
| | Sport and Recreation | 3 |
| | Women | 4 |
| | Community Services, Ageing, Disability Services, Youth | 4 |
| | Ageing, Disability Services and Home Care | 4 |
| | Community Services | 4 |
| Appendix 1 | Witnesses | 6 |
| Appendix 2 | Minutes of proceedings | 8 |

Chair's Foreword

General Purpose Standing Committee No 2 has examined the Budget Estimates for 2004-2005 for the portfolio areas of:

- Health
- Gaming and Racing
- Tourism
- Sport and Recreation
- Women
- Community Services
- Ageing, Disability Services and Home Care
- Youth

Some members of the Committee believed that a number of questions taken on notice by some of the departments in the first round of hearings were not answered satisfactorily and that further hearings were necessary. Accordingly, supplementary hearings for NSW Health and for the Department of Ageing, Disability Services and Home Care were conducted.

Again, members of the Committee believed that a number of questions taken on notice by NSW Health at the supplementary hearing were not answered satisfactorily. These questions were re-submitted to NSW Health with a request for more comprehensive responses.

Some of the further answers received from the Department were not considered satisfactory by a majority of members of the Committee. Members of the Committee were disappointed with the apparent reluctance of the department to provide the specific information that was requested of them.

The Committee expresses its appreciation to the Ministers and officers of the departments and organisations who appeared before it.

The Hon Patricia Forsythe MLC
Chair

Chapter 1 Introduction

Examination of budget estimates

- 1.1 General Purpose Standing Committee No 2 examined the Budget Estimates and related documents for its portfolios at a series of public hearings held on the following dates:
- 14 September 2004 Health
 - 16 September 2004 Gaming and Racing
 - 17 September 2004 Tourism, Sport and Recreation, Women
 - 17 September 2004 Community Services, Ageing, Disability Services, Youth
- 1.2 This report outlines the administrative details of the budget estimates hearing process and a brief summary of some of the key issues raised. The full transcript of evidence taken at these hearings can be found at the Committee's Web page accessible via the Parliament's home page at: www.parliament.nsw.gov.au/budgetestimates. Hard copies of the transcript can be obtained by contacting the General Purpose Standing Committee Secretariat on 02 9230 3544.
- 1.3 During these hearings, Ministers took a number of questions on notice. Copies of the questions and answers can be found at the Committee's Web page at the above address or by contacting the secretariat on the above number.
- 1.4 In addition the Committee lodged written questions on notice for all the portfolio areas by following the usual procedure of placing questions on the notice paper with the Clerks at the Table on days that the House sits.
- 1.5 The Committee resolved to undertake supplementary hearings into the portfolios of Health and Disability, Ageing and Home Care to seek further information in particular areas. The hearings took place on 20 December 2004, and the key issues appear below at 2.3.

Portfolios

- Health
- Gaming and Racing
- Tourism
- Sport and Recreation
- Women
- Community Services
- Ageing, Disability Services and Home Care
- Youth

Chapter 2 Public hearings – by portfolio

The key topics discussed at the hearing are provided below. For further details on these, and other matters, see the Hansard record of the hearing, available on the Committee's web page accessible via the Parliament's website at www.parliament.nsw.gov.au/budgetestimates.

Health

- 2.1 On 14 September 2004 the Committee conducted public hearings into the portfolio of Health.
- 2.2 Amongst the issues discussed, the reconfiguration of Area Health Services and the Ambulance Service's performance indicators were of particular focus. Other key issues discussed included:
- Northern Beaches hospital services
 - mental health service provision
 - the nursing workforce
 - after hours GP clinics in emergency departments
 - health system preparedness in the event of a terrorist attack
 - public-private partnerships for developing health infrastructure
 - hospital waiting lists.

Supplementary hearing

- 2.3 On 20 December 2004 a supplementary hearing was conducted, with mental health services again a major focus. The key issues discussed concerned:
- suicide, homicide and assault rates among psychiatric patients
 - recruitment and retention of mental health staff
 - 'Tracking Tragedy' report and Government response
 - the roles of clinical psychologists and psychiatrists
 - Ambulance Service emergency department network activation (EDNA) system
 - clinical services planning in selected hospitals
 - recruitment and retention of nurses
 - workers compensation claims by nurses
 - elective surgery waiting lists
 - administrative savings from Area Health Service amalgamations.

Gaming and Racing

- 2.4 On 16 September 2004 the Committee conducted a public hearing into the portfolio of Gaming and Racing.
- 2.5 Key issues discussed during the public hearing centred on the Casino Community Benefit Fund and services for problem gamblers. Other issues discussed included:
- the gaming machine tax
 - alcohol harm minimisation
 - gambling harm minimisation
 - cost of the Temby inquiry into the Panthers club
 - Racing Industry Participants Advisory Committee.

Tourism, Sport and Recreation, Women

- 2.6 On 17 September 2004 the Committee conducted a public hearing into the portfolios of Tourism, Sport and Recreation, Women.

Tourism

- 2.7 A number of issues were discussed during the hearing, including the marketing of New South Wales as a tourist destination both nationally and in emerging markets. Other key issues discussed included:
- Luna Park
 - grants for promotion of regional events
 - New South Wales visitation numbers
 - proposed zoo and aquarium at Darling Harbour.

Sport and Recreation

- 2.8 A number of issues were discussed during the hearing, including corruption and sexual misconduct by Departmental officers. Other key issues discussed included:
- the role of the Department of Sport and Recreation in monitoring children's obesity and activity levels
 - funding for disabled athletes
 - client and staff safety at Berry Sport and Recreation Centre.

Women

- 2.9** Key issues discussed concerned the abolition of the Department for Women and the transferral of functions to the Office for Women and the impact of ageing on the female population. Other topics covered were:
- Sister Speak program for Aboriginal girls
 - Lucy Program for mentoring potential female executives.

Community Services, Ageing, Disability Services, Youth

- 2.10** On 17 September 2004 the Committee conducted public hearings into the portfolios of Community Services, Ageing, Disability Services and Youth. No significant issues were raised relating to the Youth portfolio.

Ageing, Disability Services and Home Care

- 2.11** Amongst the issues discussed, changes to the Post-School Options and ATLAS programs were of particular focus. Other key issues discussed included:
- the new Community Participation and Transition to Work programs
 - devolution of large residential institutions
 - collection and provision of output and outcomes data
 - aids and appliances for disabled people in departmental-operated facilities
 - support for Home Care carers.

Community Services

- 2.12** In the Community Services area, the following issues were among the key issues discussed:
- auditing of case files of children and young people
 - filling of additional caseworker positions
 - fees for inter-country adoptions
 - out of home care programs
 - support programs for young people
 - out of home care placements for Indigenous children
 - quarterly child protection data.

Supplementary hearing

- 2.13** On 20 December 2004 a supplementary hearing was conducted. The key issues discussed concerned:

- the Community Participation and Transition to Work programs
- high support need supplements for clients
- representation of carers and participants in community consultation on reforms
- role of new network managers
- service providers that will continue to provide services in 2005
- nature and rationale for block funding as part of reforms
- Supported Employment Services
- Occupational Health and Safety issues, and workforce issues
- capacity of home care service and movement of home care clients into aged care facilities
- Respite care.

Appendix 1 Witnesses

1 Health

| Date | Name | Position and Organisation | |
|---------------------|---|---|--|
| 14 September 2004 | The Hon. M. Iemma MP | Minister for Health | |
| | Ms R. Kruk | Director General Department of Health | |
| | Mr R. McGregor | Deputy Director General, Health System Support Department of Health | |
| | Mr K. Barker | Chief Financial Officer Department of Health | |
| | Dr R. Matthews | Deputy Director General, Strategic Development Department of Health | |
| | Dr G. Stewart | Deputy Director General, Population Health Department of Health | |
| | Professor K. McGrath | Deputy Director General, Health System Performance Department of Health | |
| | 20 December 2004 (supplementary hearing) | Ms R Kruk, | Director General Department of Health |
| | | Mr R McGregor | Deputy-Director General, Strategic Development Department of Health |
| | | Mr K Barker | Chief Financial Officer Department of Health |
| Dr. B Raphael | | Director, Centre for Mental Health Department of Health | |
| Professor K McGrath | | Deputy Director General, Health System Performance Department of Health | |

2 Gaming and Racing

| Date | Name | Position and Organisation |
|-------------------|---------------------------|--|
| 16 September 2004 | The Hon. G. A. McBride MP | Minister for Gaming and Racing |
| | Mr D Loewenthal | Acting Director General Department of Gaming and Racing |
| | Mr M Foggo | Director, Revenue and Resource Management Department of Gaming and Racing |
| | Ms J Hennessy | Director, Policy and Development Department of Gaming and Racing |
| | Mr B. Farrell | Chief Executive Officer |

| Date | Name | Position and Organisation |
|-------------|-------------|----------------------------------|
| | | Casino Control Authority |

3 Tourism, Sport and Recreation, Women

| Date | Name | Position and Organisation |
|-------------------|------------------------|---|
| 17 September 2004 | The Hon Sandra Nori MP | Minister for Tourism and Sport and Recreation, and Minister for Women |
| | Mr W Healey | Director General Department of Tourism, Sport and Recreation |
| | Mr J Shipway | Acting Manager, Human Resource Department of Tourism, Sport and Recreation |
| | Ms L Coombs | Assistant Director General Office for Women |

4 Community Services, Ageing, Disability Services, Youth

| Date | Name | Position and Organisation |
|---|-------------------------|--|
| 17 December 2004 | The Hon C M Tebbutt MLC | Minister for Community Services, Minister for Ageing, Minister for Disability Services, and Minister for Youth |
| | Mr B O'Reilly | Director General Department of Ageing, Disability and Home Care |
| | Ms C Mills | Deputy Director General Department of Ageing, Disability and Home Care |
| | Mr S Mudge | Chief Financial Officer Department of Ageing, Disability and Home Care |
| | Dr N Shepherd | Director General Department of Community Services |
| | Ms D Rygate | Executive Director, Office of the Director General Department of Community Services |
| | Mr J Parisi | Director Financial Services Department of Community Services |
| | Ms G Calvert | Commissioner Commission for Children and Young People |
| | Ms L Mallett | Children's Guardian Office of the Children's Guardian |
| 20 December 2004 (Supplementary hearing) | Mr B O'Reilly | Director General Department of Ageing, Disability and Home Care |
| | Ms C Mills, | Deputy Director General Department of Ageing, Disability and Home Care |
| | Ms E McAlpine | Deputy Director General Department of Ageing, Disability and Home Care |

Appendix 2 Minutes of proceedings

Minutes No 28

Tuesday 14 September 2004

General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2

At Parliament House at 5.15pm, Room 814/815

1. **Members Present**

Revd Dr Gordon Moyes (*Chair*)

Ms Patricia Forsythe (*Deputy Chair*)

Mr Eric Roozendaal (Catanzariti)

Dr Arthur Chesterfield-Evans

Ms Robyn Parker (Pavey)

Ms Amanda Fazio (Robertson)

Mr Ian West (Tsang)

2. **Participating member**

Ms Melinda Pavey

3. **Substitute arrangements**

The Chair advised that Mr Roozendaal would be representing Mr Catanzariti, Ms Fazio would be representing Ms Robertson, Mr West would be representing Mr Tsang, and Ms Parker would be representing Ms Pavey for the purposes of this meeting.

4. ...

5. **Budget Estimates 2004-2005**

The Chair made a statement to Members regarding the broadcasting of proceedings.

The Hon Morris Iemma MP, Minister for Health, was admitted and accompanied by the following advisers:

Department of Health

Ms Robyn Kruk, Director General

Mr Robert McGregor, Deputy Director General, Health System Support

Mr Ken Barker, Chief Financial Officer

Dr Greg Stewart, Deputy Director General, Population Health and Chief Health Officer

Dr Richard Matthews, Deputy Director General, Strategic Development

The public and media were admitted.

The Chair made a statement regarding certain procedural matters during hearings on budget estimates.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Health open for examination.

The Minister and his advisers answered questions by Members of the Committee.

The Minister tabled a document: 'NSW Government answers to questions posed by Dr Arthur Chesterfield-Evans regarding the Government's responses to the inquiry into mental health services in NSW.'

Examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Health concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The Committee deliberated.

Resolved, on the motion of Ms Fazio, that the Committee accept the document tendered by the Minister.

Resolved, on the motion of Ms Forsythe, that under section 4 of the *Parliamentary Papers (Supplementary Provisions) Act 1975* and under the authority of Standing Order 224, the Committee authorises the Clerk of the Committee to publish the documents accepted by the Committee during today's hearing.

6. Adjournment

The Committee adjourned at 7:35pm until 8.00pm on Thursday 16 September 2004.

Beverley Duffy
Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No 29

Thursday 16 September 2004
General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2
At Parliament House at 8.00pm, Room 814/815

1. Members Present

Revd Dr Gordon Moyes (*Chair*)
Ms Patricia Forsythe (*Deputy Chair*)
Mr Tony Catanzariti
Dr Arthur Chesterfield-Evans
Ms Melinda Pavey
Mr Eddie Obeid (Robertson)
Mr Henry Tsang

2. Substitute arrangements

The Chair advised that Mr Obeid would be representing Ms Robertson for the purposes of this meeting.

3. Correspondence

The Chair tabled the following items of correspondence:

Received

Letter from the Hon Melinda Pavey MLC requesting that the Chair request the attendance of Mr John Shipway from the Human Resources division of the Department of Tourism, Sport and Recreation at the Friday 17th September 2004 11.30am meeting of GPSC 2.

The Chair advised that Mr Shipway had been requested to attend the Committee's hearing on Friday 17 September and that Mr Shipway had indicated his availability to attend the hearing.

4. Budget Estimates 2004-2005

The Chair made a statement to Members regarding the broadcasting of proceedings.

The Hon Grant McBride MP, Minister for Gaming and Racing, was admitted and accompanied by the following advisers:

Department of Gaming and Racing

Mr Darrell Loewenthal, Deputy Director General
Ms Jill Hennessy, Director Policy and Development
Mr Michael Foggo, Director Revenue and Resource Management

Casino Control Authority

Mr Brian Farrell, Chief Executive

The public and media were admitted.

The Chair made a statement regarding certain procedural matters during hearings on budget estimates.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Gaming and Racing open for examination.

The Minister and his advisers answered questions by Members of the Committee.

Mr Loewenthal tendered the following document relating to the Inquiry into the Penrith Rugby League Club Limited (Temby Inquiry): 'Section 41X Inquiry Costs – Estimated'

Examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Gaming and Racing concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The Committee deliberated.

Resolved, on the motion of Ms Pavey, that the Committee accept the document tendered by Mr Loewenthal.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Tsang, that under section 4 of the *Parliamentary Papers (Supplementary Provisions) Act 1975* and under the authority of Standing Order 224, the Committee authorises the Clerk of the Committee to publish the documents accepted by the Committee during today's hearing.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Obeid that the committee would not hold supplementary hearings for the portfolio of Gaming and Racing.

5. **Adjournment**

The Committee adjourned at 10.05pm until 11:30am on Friday 17 September 2004.

Rachel Simpson
Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No 30

Friday 17 September 2004
General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2
At Parliament House at 11:15am, Room 814/815

1. **Members Present**

Ms Forsythe (*Acting Chair*)
Mr David Oldfield (Revd Dr Gordon Moyes)
Mr Eddie Obeid (Catanzariti)
Dr Arthur Chesterfield-Evans
Ms Melinda Pavey
Ms Amanda Fazio (Robertson)
Mr Henry Tsang

2. **Substitute arrangements**

The Chair advised that Mr Obeid would be representing Mr Catanzariti, Ms Fazio would be representing Ms Robertson and Mr Oldfield would be representing Mr Moyes for the purposes of this meeting.

3. **Budget Estimates 2004-2005**

The Chair made a statement to Members regarding the broadcasting of proceedings.

The Hon Sandra Nori MP, Minister for Tourism, Sport and Recreation, and Minister for Women, was admitted and accompanied by the following advisers:

Department of Tourism, Sport and Recreation

Mr Bill Healey, Director General
Mr John Shipway, A/Manager Human Resources

Premier's Department

Ms Liz Coombes, Assistant Director General

Tourism NSW

Mr John O'Neill, Executive Director
The public and media were admitted.

The Chair made a statement regarding certain procedural matters during hearings on budget estimates.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Tourism, Sport and Recreation, and Women open for examination.

The Minister and her advisers answered questions by Members of the Committee.

Examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Tourism, Sport and Recreation, and Women concluded.

The Chair advised the witnesses that the Committee had resolved to seek the return of answers to questions on notice within 35 calendar days and that the Committee may hold further hearings.

The witnesses and the public withdrew.

5. Adjournment

The Committee adjourned at 1.30pm until 2.00pm on Friday 17 September 2004.

Rachel Callinan
Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No 31

Friday 17 September 2004

General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2

At Parliament House at 2.00pm, Jubilee

1. Members Present

Revd Dr Gordon Moyes (*Chair*)
Ms Patricia Forsythe (*Deputy Chair*)
Mr Eddie Obeid (Catanzariti)
Dr Arthur Chesterfield-Evans
Mr John Ryan (Pavey)
Mr Eric Roozendaal (Robertson)
Ms Amanda Fazio (Tsang)

2. Substitute arrangements

The Chair advised that Mr Obeid would be representing Mr Catanzariti, Mr Roozendaal would be representing Ms Robertson, Ms Fazio would be representing Mr Tsang, and Mr Ryan would be representing Ms Pavey for the purposes of this meeting.

3. Budget Estimates 2004-2005

The Chair made a statement to Members regarding the broadcasting of proceedings.

The Hon Carmel Tebbutt MLC, Minister for Community Services, Minister for Ageing, Minister for Disability Services and Minister for Youth, was admitted and accompanied by the following advisers:

Department of Ageing, Disability and Home Care

Mr Brendan O'Reilly, Director General
Ms Carol Mills, Deputy Director General
Mr Stephen Mudge, Chief Financial Officer

Department of Community Services

Dr Neil Shepherd, Director General
Ms Donna Rygate, Executive Director, Office of the Director General
Mr John Parisi, Director, Financial Services

Commission for Children and Young People

Ms Gillian Calvert, Commissioner

Office of the Children's Guardian

Ms Linda Mallett, Children's Guardian

The public and media were admitted.

The Chair made a statement regarding certain procedural matters during hearings on budget estimates.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Community Services, Ageing, Disability Services and Youth open for examination.

The Minister and her advisers answered questions by Members of the Committee.

Examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Community Services, Ageing, Disability Services and Youth concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The committee deliberated.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Ryan, to hold a supplementary hearing to consider matters relating to the portfolio area of Disability Services, the date of which will be determined upon receipt of answers to questions on notice.

4. Adjournment

The Committee adjourned at 4.10pm *sine die*.

Merrin Thompson
Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No 33

Wednesday 10 November 2004
General Purpose Standing Committee No 2
Room 1153, Parliament House at 2pm

1. Members Present

Mrs Patricia Forsythe (Chair)
Mr Tony Catanzariti (Deputy Chair)
Revd Gordon Moyes
Mr Eddie Obeid (Robertson)
Mr Peter Primrose (Tsang)
Dr Arthur Chesterfield-Evans
Ms Melinda Pavey

2. Apologies

Ms Christine Robertson

3. Substitutions

The Chair noted that she had been advised by the Government Whip that he would substitute for Mr Tsang that Mr Obeid would be substituting for Ms Robertson

4. Confirmation of Minutes

Mrs Forsythe asked that Minutes No. 30 be amended to reflect the correct spelling of the witness' name as being Mr Bill Healey.

Resolved, on the motion of Revd Moyes, that Minutes No. 28-32 as amended, be adopted.

7. Estimates

The Committee noted its resolution of 17 September 2004, Minutes No. 31, to hold a supplementary hearing to consider matters relating to the portfolio area of Disability Services.

The Committee deliberated on answers to questions taken on notice during the hearings.

The Chair noted, in regard to the Health portfolio, that she required further information on responses to questions taken on notice in the areas of sanctions on CEOs of Area Health Services who do not meet targets, and the Hospital Capacity Study. Dr Chesterfield-Evans noted he wished to receive further information on mental health.

Resolved, on the motion of Dr Chesterfield-Evans, that the Committee hold a supplementary hearing to consider matters relating to the portfolio area of Health, inviting Ms Robyn Kruk, Director General, NSW Health, and Ms Beverly Raphael, Director of the Centre for Mental Health, as well as other witnesses they may wish to bring with them.

The Chair indicated that she intended both hearings to be half-day hearings, to be held on the same day, if possible.

8. **Adjournment**

The Committee adjourned at 2:25pm until Wednesday 8 December 2004, in the dinner break.

Steven Reynolds
Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No 34

Wednesday 8 December 2004

General Purpose Standing Committee No 2

Room 1108, Parliament House at 6.40pm

1. **Members Present**

Mrs Patricia Forsythe (Chair)
Mr Tony Catanzariti (Deputy Chair)
Ms Jan Burnswoods (Tsang)
Ms Melinda Pavey
Ms Christine Robertson
Dr Arthur Chesterfield-Evans
Revd Gordon Moyes

2. **Substitutions**

The Chair noted the written advice from the Government Whip that Ms Burnswoods would be substituting for Mr Tsang.

3. **Confirmation of Minutes**

Resolved on the motion of Mr Catanzariti: That Minutes No. 33 be adopted.

4. ...

5. ...

6. **Budget Estimates 2004-2005**

The Committee considered the impact the likely late sitting of the House of Thursday 9 December would have on the Budget Estimates hearing scheduled for Friday 10 December.

Resolved on motion of Dr Chesterfield-Evans: That the Committee reschedule the Budget Estimates hearing into the portfolios areas of Health, Disability Services, and Home Care from Friday 10 December to Monday 20 December 2004.

Resolved on motion of Dr Chesterfield-Evans: That the Committee, at the conclusion of the Budget Estimates hearing on 20 December 2004, hold a deliberative meeting to consider items held over from this meeting.

7. ...

8. ...

9. **Adjournment**

The Committee adjourned at 7.55pm until 9.15am on Monday 20 December 2004 (Budget Estimates).

Steven Reynolds
Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No 35

Monday 20 December 2004

General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2

At Parliament House at 9.30am, in the Jubilee Room

1. Members Present

Ms Patricia Forsythe (*Chair*)
Mr Tony Catanzariti (*Deputy Chair*)
Dr Arthur Chesterfield-Evans
Revd Dr Gordon Moyes
Ms Melinda Pavey
Mr John Ryan (Pavey – from 2pm)
Ms Amanda Fazio (Robertson)
Mr Henry Tsang

2. Substitute arrangements

The Chair advised that Ms Fazio would be representing Ms Robertson for the purposes of this meeting, and that Mr Ryan would be substituting for Ms Pavey from 2pm onwards.

3. Budget Estimates 2004-2005

The Chair made a statement to Members regarding the broadcasting of proceedings.

The following witnesses were admitted:

Ms Robyn Kruk, Director General, NSW Health
Mr Ken Barker, Chief Financial Officer
Prof Catherine McGrath, Deputy Director General, Health System Performance
Mr Robert McGregor, Deputy Director General, Health System Support
Dr Beverley Raphael, Director, Centre for Mental Health.

The public and media were admitted.

The Chair made a statement regarding certain procedural matters during hearings on budget estimates.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio area of Health open for examination.

The witnesses answered questions by Members of the Committee.

Ms Kruk tendered the following documents:

- *NSW Government response to Tracking Tragedy*, 5 December 2004
- *Camden Hospital maternity services*, Media Statement 17 December 2004

The Chair advised the witnesses that the Committee had determined that it would allow 35 calendar days for the provision of written answers to any questions taken on notice during the hearing.

Examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio area of Health concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

Members of the public and the media withdrew.

4. Deliberative meeting

Budget Estimates 2004-2005

Resolved on motion of Dr Moyes: That the Committee conclude its public examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio area of Health.

Confirmation of Minutes

Resolved on motion of Dr Moyes: That Minutes 34 be confirmed.

...

5. Budget Estimates hearing (continued)

The following witnesses were admitted:

Mr Brendan O'Reilly, Director General, Department of Ageing, Disability and Home Care (DADHC)

Ms Carol Mills, Deputy Director General, DADHC

Ms Ethel McAlpine, Deputy Director General, DADHC

Ms Carolyn Burlew, Deputy Director General, DADHC

Mr Stephen Mudge, Chief Financial Officer, DADHC

Ms Claire Vernon, Director, Home Care, DADHC

The public and media were admitted.

The Chair made a statement regarding certain procedural matters during hearings on budget estimates.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Disability Services and Home Care open for examination.

The witnesses answered questions by Members of the Committee.

The Chair advised the witnesses that the Committee had determined that it would allow 35 calendar days for the provision of written answers to any questions taken on notice during the hearing.

Examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Disability Services and Home Care concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

Members of the public and the media withdrew.

6. Deliberative meeting

Budget Estimates 2004-2005

Resolved on motion of Dr Moyes: That the Committee conclude its public examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio area of Ageing, Disability and Home Care.

Resolved on motion of Mr Catanzaritti: That the Committee consider adoption of the Chair's draft report at its next deliberative meeting on 23 February 2005, subject to the Chair's draft being circulated to Members one week prior to that meeting.

...

7. Adjournment

The Committee adjourned at 4.25pm until 9.30am, Wednesday 23 February 2005.

Tanya Bosch
Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No 36

Wednesday 23 February 2005

Room 1108, Parliament House at 9:32am

1. Members Present

Mrs Patricia Forsythe (Chair)
Mr Tony Catanzariti (Deputy Chair)
Ms Henry Tsang
Ms Kayee Griffin (Robertson)
Ms Melinda Pavey
Revd Dr Gordon Moyes
Dr Arthur Chesterfield-Evans

2. Substitutions

The Chair noted the written advice from the Government Whip that Ms Griffin would be substituting for Ms Robertson at this meeting.

3. Confirmation of Minutes

Resolved on the motion of Mr Catanzariti: That the Committee adopt Minutes No. 35.

4. ...

5. ...

6. ...

7. Budget Estimates 2004-2005

The Committee considered the adequacy of some of the answers provided by NSW Health to questions taken on notice at the public hearing on 20 December 2004.

The Chair proposed that NSW Health be given the opportunity to provide more satisfactory responses to a number of the questions that were taken on notice. The Committee noted that this would require an extension of the current reporting date for the inquiry.

Resolved on the motion of Ms Pavey: That the Chair write to NSW Health identifying those responses to questions taken on notice that were considered unsatisfactory by Members of the Committee and requesting more satisfactory answers by Friday 4 March 2005.

Resolved on the motion of Ms Pavey: That the Chair seek the approval of the House to extend to 24 March 2005 the reporting date for the inquiry into the Budget Estimates 2004-2005.

8. ...

9. Adjournment

The Committee adjourned at 10:15am until 9.15am on Monday 28 February 2005 in the Jubilee Room, Parliament House (Inquiry into operation of Mona Vale Hospital).

Steven Reynolds
Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No 38

Tuesday 8 March 2005

Jubilee Room, Parliament House at 9:30am

1. Members Present

Mrs Patricia Forsythe (Chair)
Mr Tony Catanzariti (Deputy Chair)
Ms Amanda Fazio (Ms Henry Tsang)
Ms Christine Robertson
Ms Melinda Pavey
Revd Dr Gordon Moyes
Dr Arthur Chesterfield-Evans

2. Substitutions

The Chair noted the written advice from the Government Whip that Ms Fazio would be substituting for Mr Tsang for the duration of the inquiry.

3. ...

4. Deliberative meeting

4.1 Confirmation of minutes

Resolved on motion of Ms Pavey: That the Committee adopt Minutes No. 37.

4.2 ...

4.3 ...

4.4 ...

4.5 Budget Estimates 2004-2005

The further responses provided by NSW Health, having been previously circulated to Members, were taken as being read.

The Committee deliberated.

Notice of motion to rescind resolution

Dr Chesterfield-Evans gave notice that at the next meeting of the Committee he would move a motion to rescind the resolution of the Committee on 12 December 2004: That the Committee conclude its public examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio area of Health.

5. Adjournment

The Committee adjourned at 5.15 pm until 9.00am on Monday 21 March (site visit).

John Young

Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No 40

Monday 21 March 2005

Jubilee Room, Parliament House at 2:05m

1. Members Present

Mrs Patricia Forsythe (Chair)
Mr Tony Catanzariti (Deputy Chair)
Ms Amanda Fazio (Ms Henry Tsang)
Ms Christine Robertson
Ms Melinda Pavey
Revd Dr Gordon Moyes

Dr Arthur Chesterfield-Evans

2. **Substitutions**

The Chair noted advice from the Government Whip that Ms Fazio would also be substituting for Mr Tsang at this meeting with respect to the Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2004-2005 and the Inquiry into Post School Disability Services.

3. ...

4. **Confirmation of Minutes**

Resolved on motion of Ms Fazio: That the Committee adopt Minutes No. 38.

5. ...

6. **Motion of rescission relating to previous resolution of the committee**

At meeting No. 38 Dr Chesterfield-Evans gave notice of his intention to move a motion to rescind the resolution of the Committee at the 20 December 2004 meeting to conclude its public examination of the portfolio area of Health.

The relevant motion that was resolved in the affirmative at the meeting of 20 December 2004 is as follows:

That the Committee conclude its public examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio area of Health.

Dr Chesterfield-Evans moved a motion to rescind the resolution of the Committee.

Question put.

Motion lost on the voices.

7. **Budget Estimates 2004-2005 – Chair’s Draft Report**

The Chair’s Draft Report having been previously circulated to members was taken as being read.

Resolved on motion of Dr Chesterfield Evans: That the Chair’s Foreword be amended by inserting, after the word ‘Youth’, the following new paragraphs:

Some members of the Committee believed that a number of questions taken on notice by some of the departments in the first round of hearings were not answered satisfactorily and that further hearings were necessary.

Accordingly, supplementary hearings for NSW Health and for the Department of Ageing, Disability Services and Home Care were conducted.

Again, members of the Committee believed that a number of questions taken on notice by NSW Health at the supplementary hearing were not answered satisfactorily. These questions were re-submitted to NSW Health with a request for more comprehensive responses.

Some of the further answers received from the department were not considered satisfactory by a majority of members of the Committee.

Members of the Committee were disappointed with the apparent reluctance of the department to provide the specific information that was requested of them.

Resolved on motion of Ms Pavey: That the report, as amended, be adopted as the report of the Committee.

Resolved on motion of Ms Pavey: That the report be signed by the Chair and presented to the House in accordance with Standing Order 230.

8. ...

9. ...

10. Adjournment

The Committee adjourned at 5.15 pm *sine die*.

Steven Reynolds
Clerk to the Committee